

SCRUTINY BOARD (CITY DEVELOPMENT)

TUESDAY, 8TH MARCH, 2011

PRESENT: Councillor J Procter in the Chair

Councillors J Akhtar, B Atha, J Elliott,
P Grahame, R Grahame, G Harper,
P Latty, R Pryke, M Rafique and
M Robinson

B Woroncow (Co-optee)

116 Chair's Opening Remarks

The Chair welcomed everyone to the March meeting of the Scrutiny Board (City Development) held in the Lord Mayor's Banqueting Hall due to a large number of people in attendance.

117 Late Items

The Chair agreed to accept the following documents as supplementary information:-

- E mail correspondence received from Tim Brigstocke, Executive Chairman, Rare Breeds Survival Trust; Sarah Hill and Mike Sandison, Chairman Shetland Cattle Breeders' Association (and keeper of Shetland and North Ronaldsay sheep) in relation to a request for scrutiny of the Farming Operations at Home Farm, Temple Newsam (Agenda Item 9) (Minute 122 refers)
- E mail correspondence received from Steve Grubb; Helen Cowley, Club Secretary, Kippax and District Harriers; Sue Corbally; Ian Cowie and Natalie Mitchell in relation to a request for scrutiny on the reduced hours to be introduced at Garforth Leisure Centre (Agenda Item 10) (Minute 124 refers)
- E mail correspondence received from S Leatham and E Leatham ; Pat Cooney,; Claire Haysom; Alan Scott; Gail Schuster; Debbie Beattie; David Thornton and Craig Pease in relation to a petition regarding the closure of East Leeds Leisure Centre (Agenda Item 11) (Minute 125 refers)

118 Declaration of Interests

The following personal interests were declared at the meeting:-

- Councillor R Grahame in his capacity as a Member on Plans Panel (East) and also a Member of the Credit Union (Agenda Item 12) (Minute 126 refers)
- Barbara Woroncow in her capacity as a Member of the Vision Steering Group (Agenda Item 13) (Minute 127 refers)

119 Apologies for Absence and Notification of Substitutes

Apologies for absence were received on behalf of Councillors D Atkinson, J Jarosz and M Lobley.

Notification had been received for Councillor R Grahame to substitute for Councillor D Atkinson; Councillor P Grahame to substitute for Councillor J Jarosz and Councillor P Latty to substitute for Councillor M Lobley.

120 Minutes of the Previous Meeting

RESOLVED –

(i) That the minutes of the previous meeting held on 8th February 2011 be confirmed as a correct record.

(ii) The Chair referred to Minute 109 and confirmed that he had met with the Leader of Council concerning the request by the Market Traders to be provided with at least an outline of a market strategy by the 11th February 2011.

121 Outcome of Consultation on Proposed Withdrawal of Remaining Crèche Provision at Leisure Centres

Referring to Minute 84 of the meeting held on 7th December 2010, a report of the Head of Scrutiny and Member Development was submitted on the outcome of consultation on the proposed withdrawal of remaining crèche provision at Leisure Centres.

Appended to the report was a copy of a document entitled 'Crèche Provision in Council Leisure Centres – Report of the Acting Director of City Development' for the information/comment of the meeting.

The following representatives were in attendance and gave evidence to the Board and responded to Board Members' queries and comments:-

Councillor A Ogilvie, Executive Member Leisure
Richard Mond, Chief Recreation Officer, City Development Directorate
Mark Allman, Head of Sport and Active Recreation, City Development Directorate
Lisa Kitching, Spokesperson for Crèche Users

The Board noted that both Councillor M Lobley and Councillor J Matthews who had instigated the original request for scrutiny had conveyed their apologies for this item.

At the request of the Chair, Councillor A Ogilvie, Executive Member; Leisure reported on the outcome of the consultation and thanked everyone who had contributed to it. Councillor Ogilvie announced that as a consequence of users concerns he had decided to keep four crèches open at Scott Hall, Rothwell, Pudsey and Kippax Leisure Centres for a further six months. Work would continue to seek alternative provision and on assessing the viability of the crèches with the increased prices by the Early Years Services Business Advisers Team and the Managers at each Leisure Centre. However, he reported that there would be an increase in the fee charged for children

attending these crèches from £2.00 per hour to £4.00 per hour with the Leeds Card discount and Leeds Card extra continuing to apply as appropriate.

The Chair thanked the Executive Member, officers and the spokesperson for their contribution and attendance at the meeting.

RESOLVED –

- a) That the contents of the report and appendices be noted.
- b) That this Board notes and welcomes the decision of the Executive Member to keep crèche facilities open at Scott Hall, Pudsey, Rothwell and Kippax Leisure Centres for a further 6 months whilst potential alternative operators continue to be sought as now outlined.
- c) That no further action be undertaken on this matter.

122 Request for Scrutiny of the Farming Operations at Home Farm, Temple Newsam as a Consequence of the Farming Operations - Consultation Document from Parks and Countryside

The Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report on a request for scrutiny regarding the proposals in the farming operations consultation document issued by the City Development Directorate on the future of Home Farm at Temple Newsam and its work to promote rare breeds and the farms many conservation activities.

Appended to the report were copies of the following correspondence for the information/comment of the meeting:-

- Letter from Yvonne Froehlich, Breed Secretary, White Park Cattle Society dated 31st January 2011
- Letter from Mr G L H Alderson, Founder President/Trustee Rare Breeds International dated 30th January 2011

In addition to the above correspondence, copies of e mails received from Tim Brigstocke, Sarah Hill and Mike Sandison were circulated with attachments as supplementary information.

The following representatives were in attendance and responded to Board Members' queries and comments:-

Richard Mond, Chief Recreation Officer, City Development
Mr P Titley, Rare Breed Survival Trust
Mr G L H Alderson, Founder President/Trustee, Rare Breeds International
Mr T Brigstocke, Rare Breed Survival Trust (RBST)

The Chair invited Mr Titley, Mr Alderson and Mr Brigstocke to outline the main points of their concerns regarding the proposals in the farming operations consultation document issued by the City Development Directorate on the future of Home Farm at Temple Newsam and its work to promote rare breeds and the farms many conservation activities.

The Chair then invited Richard Mond, Chief Recreation Officer, City Development to respond to the main points.

Board Members then questioned the representatives.

In summary, specific reference was made to the following issues:-

- The decision to reduce the budget at Home Farm by £100,000 in 2011/12
- The fact that the reduction in the acreage at Home Farm from 257 hectares to 45 hectares and consequent reduction in livestock will reduce this farm to a visitors centre and end 30 years of cutting edge development of rare breeds
- The lack of detail provided by the Directorate in their consultation document and whether or not the RBST case had been presented to the department
(The Principal Scrutiny Adviser confirmed that the additional information provided by the RBST had been circulated to all Members of the Board today and that the City Development Directorate had received their submission)
- The importance of Home Farm and the offer by the RBST and other groups to work with the Council to try and maintain Home Farm as a rare breed centre and find ways to significantly reduce the costs of the farm (use of volunteers etc)
(Mr Brigsocke, Rare Breeds Survival Trust offered to develop with the Council a robust business plan for Home Farm, but warned that this could take a couple of years before significant savings could be achieved. He referred to the success of other local authorities in obtaining Heritage lottery funding and support with apprenticeship schemes for their rare breed centres. He stressed that Home Farm was internationally recognised as a rare breed centre and further discussions needed to take place with all partners to identify ways of saving it)
(The Chief Recreation Officer stated that the consultation was now complete and his budget for this service in 2011/12 had already been cut, but welcomed the suggestions and range of offers put forward by the various organisations and looked forward to working with them to see how costs could be reduced)
- clarification of the timescales in relation to the cessation of rare breeds at Temple Newsam
(The Chief Recreation Officer responded and agreed to consult with the Head of Parks and Countryside with a view to circulating this information to the Board)
- The need for a detailed paper setting out the income and expenditure of Home Farm and clarification as to whether all income is allowed to remain in the Farm's accounts or whether it was vired to other vote heads
- The view that this issue would also have an effect on the operations at Lineham Farm

RESOLVED –

- a) That the contents of the report and appendices be noted.
- b) That the request for scrutiny regarding the future of the Rare Breed Centre at Home Farm following completion of the consultation undertaken by the City Development Directorate be approved.
- c) That a time-limited working group be established to consider the offers made by the Rare Breed Survival Trust and Rare Breeds International Trust regarding the future of Home Farm.
- d) That the Chief Recreation Officer prepare a report for consideration by the Working Group setting out the facts following the Council Budget meeting to include a balance sheet showing income and expenditure for 2009/10, 2010/11 and 2011/12 projected and clarification as to whether all income is retained in the farming operations or whether any was vired to other vote heads.

123 Inquiry on the Future of Kirkgate Market - Session 4

Referring to Minute 109 of the meeting held on 8th March 2011, the Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report on the fourth session of the Board's Inquiry to consider the Future of Kirkgate Market.

Appended to the report were copies of the following documents for the information/comment of the meeting:-

- Scrutiny Board (City Development) – Inquiry to Consider the Future of Kirkgate Market – Terms of Reference
- Inquiry on the Future of Kirkgate Market – Session 4 Evidence for Scrutiny – Report of the Acting Director of City Development

The following representatives/witnesses were in attendance and gave evidence to the Board and responded to Board Members' queries and comments:-

Paul Stephens, Chief Economic Development Officer, City Development
Sue Burgess, Markets Manager, City Development
Jo Williams, Consultant, National Market Traders' Federation (NMTF) (Kirkgate Branch)
Liz Laughton, National Market Traders' Federation (NMTF) (Kirkgate Branch)
Michele Hocken, National Market Traders' Federation (NMTF) (Kirkgate Branch)
Lucky Singh, National Market Traders' Federation (NMTF) (Kirkgate Branch)
John Perriton, National Market Traders' Federation (NMTF)
Sara Gonzalez, Friends of Kirkgate Market

Prior to discussing this issue, the Chair and Councillor G Harper wished to place on record their sincere thanks and appreciation to the market traders arising from their respective roles as 'Market traders for the day' in Kirkgate Market on 7th March 2011.

The Chair invited the Chief Economic Development Officer to give a brief introduction on the key points referred to within the Acting Director of City

Development's report. The Chief Officer also outlined the discussions undertaken at a recent a Markets Workshop (at the request of scrutiny) with the NMTF and Friends of Kirkgate Market where there was consensus on three specific areas namely; the need for major investment, the need for faster decision making processes and the potential for the market to become a major visitor destination. Whilst opinion was divided on the best ownership and management model there was no support for the market being wholly owned and managed by either the traders or the private sector, with the majority present giving an arm's length company as their first choice.

Councillor G Harper in his capacity as Chair of the Markets Forum also reported on the outcome of discussions at recent meetings of the Market Forum and on the topics to be discussed at future meetings.

The Chair then invited further comments in response to the above issues from Jo Williams; Liz Laughton, Michelle Hocken and Lacky Singh from the National Market Traders' Federation (NMTF) Kirkgate Branch, together with John Perriton, National Market Traders' Federation and Sara Gonzalez, Friends of Kirkgate Market.

The Board noted the comments made and acknowledged that many of the issues raised had been discussed at previous meetings as part of the ongoing Inquiry.

The Chair then invited the Chief Economic Development Officer and the Markets Manager to respond to the individual comments made.

Board Members then questioned officers and witnesses on the evidence presented.

In summary, specific reference was made to the following issues:-

- ownership and management models
- concerns of the Chair following his attendance at the market on 7th March 2011
- concerns at the market rents and discounts offered
- promotion of the market as a retail outlet to attract new customers
- service charges and the number of markets' staff that this funds
- operational and management concerns at the market
- communication issues
- reference to the Eastgate development

The Chair then allowed the Chief Economic Officer and the Markets Manager, together with Joe Williams and Liz Laughton to sum up.

The Chair informed the meeting that the next stage of the Inquiry was for a number of draft recommendations to be drawn up for consideration by the Board at it's meeting on 5th April 2011.

In concluding, the Chair, on behalf of the Board, thanked officers and witnesses for their attendance and contribution to the Inquiry.

Minutes approved as a correct record at the meeting held on Tuesday, 5th April, 2011

RESOLVED –

- a) That the contents of the report and appendices be noted.
- b) That following the conclusion of its inquiry to review the future of Kirkgate Market, a draft final report and recommendations be submitted to the Board's next pre meeting for consideration.

124 Request for Scrutiny on the reduced hours to be implemented at Garforth Leisure Centre

The Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report on a request for Scrutiny on the reduced hours to be implemented at Garforth Leisure Centre.

Appended to the report was a copy of an e mail received from Natalie Mitchell dated 22nd February 2011 for the information/comment of the meeting.

The Chair also reported the receipt of a petition to keep Garforth Squash and Leisure Centre open.

A number of e mails received from residents opposed to the reduced hours were circulated as supplementary information.

The following representatives were in attendance and responded to Board Members' queries and comments:-

Richard Mond, Chief Recreation Officer, City Development
Mark Allman, Head of Sport and Active Recreation, City Development
Ms Natalie Mitchell who submitted the request for scrutiny, together with three regular users of Garforth Leisure Centre

The Chair invited Ms Mitchell and her colleagues to outline the main points of their concerns regarding the proposals for reduced hours to be implemented at Garforth Squash and Leisure Centre.

The Chair then invited Richard Mond, Chief Recreation Officer and Mark Allman, Head of Sport and Active Recreation, City Development to respond to the main points.

Board Members then questioned the representatives on the issues raised.

RESOLVED –

- a) That the contents of the report and appendices be noted.
- b) That the request for scrutiny of the reduced hours to be implemented at Garforth Leisure Centre be approved.
- c) That the Acting Director of City Development submit a report to the next Scrutiny Board meeting on 5th April 2011 which sets out the facts concerning the budget position of this centre and the rationale behind the decision to reduce its operating hours.

125 Petition Regarding the Closure of East Leeds Leisure Centre

The Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report on a petition regarding the closure of East Leeds Leisure Centre on 31st March 2011.

Appended to the report was a copy of the front page of a petition received from the Temple Newsam Learning Partnership Trust which set out their case for keeping the Leisure Centre open for the information/comment of the meeting.

A copy of the full petition was made available at the meeting.

Prior to discussing this issue, the Chair also referred to an additional request for scrutiny received from Mr Ardeshir Durrani in relation to the proposed closure of Middleton Pool which was not included on today's agenda. Following discussions, Board Members agreed to consider this request at today's meeting, in conjunction with the closure of East Leeds Leisure Centre.

a) Petition regarding the closure of East Leeds Leisure Centre

The following representatives were in attendance and responded to Board Members' queries and comments:-

Richard Mond, Chief Recreation Officer, City Development
Mark Allman, Head of Sport and Active Recreation, City Development
Spokesperson 1
Spokesperson 2
Spokesperson 3

A number of e mails received from residents opposed to the closure of were circulated as supplementary information.

The Chair invited the spokespersons to outline the main points of their concerns regarding the proposals to close East Leeds Leisure Centre.

The Chair then invited Richard Mond, Chief Recreation Officer and Mark Allman, Head of Sport and Active Recreation, City Development to respond to the main points.

Board Members then questioned the representatives on the main points.

b) Proposed Closure of Middleton Pool

The following representatives were in attendance and responded to Board Members' queries and comments:-

Richard Mond, Chief Recreation Officer, City Development
Mark Allman, Head of Sport and Active Recreation, City Development
Mr Ardeshir Durrani, Spokesperson

The Chair invited the above spokesperson to outline the main points of his concerns regarding the proposals to close Middleton Pool.

The Chair then invited Richard Mond, Chief Recreation Officer and Mark Allman, Head of Sport and Active Recreation, City Development to respond to the main points.

RESOLVED –

- a) That the contents of the report and appendices be noted.
- b) That the request for scrutiny in relation to the closure of East Leeds Leisure Centre be approved.
- c) That the Acting Director of City Development submit a report to the next Scrutiny Board meeting on 5th April 2011 which sets out the facts concerning the budget position of East Leeds Leisure Centre and the rationale behind the decision to close it.
- d) That the request for scrutiny in relation to the proposed closure of Middleton Pool be approved.
- e) That the Acting Director of City Development submit a report to the next Scrutiny Board meeting on 5th April 2011 which sets out the facts concerning the budget position of Middleton pool and the rationale behind the decision to close it.

126 City Development Scrutiny Board Performance Report Quarter 3 2010/11
(This item was withdrawn until the 5th April 2011 meeting)

127 New Strategic Plans 2011-15
(This item was withdrawn until the 5th April 2011 meeting)

128 Grants to Culture and Sport Related Organisations Working Group
Referring to Minute 54 of the meeting held on 5th October 2010, the Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report on progress in relation to the Grants to Culture and Sport Related Organisations Working Group.

The Board's Principal Scrutiny Adviser presented the report and responded to Members' queries and comments.

Board Members commented on a number of issues including:-

- clarification of the process in relation to the percentage reduction of grants for the Leeds Carnival; Irish Festival and Asian Festival
- the further work being undertaken on grants will be reported to the working group
- the lack of information available on the income raised by organisations at events supported by the Council

RESOLVED – That the report and appendices be noted.

129 Cemeteries and Crematoria Horticultural Maintenance Working Group

Referring to Minute 88 of the meeting held on 7th December 2010, the Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a final report and recommendations of the Cemeteries and Crematoria Horticultural Maintenance Working Group following a review of this issue.

Sean Flesher, Head of Parks and Countryside, City Development was in attendance and responded to Board Members' queries and comments.

In accordance with the scrutiny procedure rules the Board's Principal Scrutiny Adviser reported that the Acting Director of City Development and the Executive Board Member Leisure had been invited to comment on the proposals. Whilst they supported recommendations 1 and 3 of the report they had concerns about recommendation 2.

They believed that implementing this recommendation in full would present difficulties on grave plots already in place and therefore do not think that a retrospective approach was practical due to difficulties associated with enforcement and related costs (particularly legal) that are likely to be involved. They also believed that a preferable solution would be to implement current conditions (with a degree of sensitivity given the nature of the service) on new graves within existing cemeteries (but not re-opened graves), cemetery extensions and new cemeteries.

RESOLVED –That having read the comments of the Acting Director of City Development, to approve the Board's final report and recommendations as originally proposed for consideration by the Executive Board in accordance with the agreed procedures.

(Councillors P Grahame and G Harper left the meeting at 1.50pm during discussions of the above item)

130 Request for Scrutiny of the Events Section, City Development Directorate

The Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report on a request for scrutiny of the Events Section of the City Development Directorate.

The following representatives were in attendance and responded to Board Members' queries and comments:-

Paul Stephens, Chief Economic Development Officer, City Development
Mark Turnbull, Head of Property, Finance and Technology, Chief Executive's Department

Board Members commented on a number of issues including:-

- advice from the legal officer concerning exempt information
- the need for the Board to consider whether there were any failings by the department in implementing recommendations of an Internal Audit report published in November 2010

- the need to discuss any weaknesses identified in the process and procedures and not individuals
- clarification as to whether Internal Audit report recommendations were monitored or tracked by audit once the report was issued to a Director

RESOLVED –

- a) That the contents of the report be noted.
- b) That request for scrutiny of the Events Section of the City Development Directorate be approved.
- c) That the Acting Director of City Development be requested to submit a report to this Board on 5th April 2011 which sets out the progress made in implementing the recommendations of the internal audit report and attaches a copy of the internal audit report.

131 Work Programme, Executive Board Minutes and Forward Plan of Key Decisions

The Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report providing Members with a copy of the Board's current Work Programme. The Executive Board minutes of 11th February 2011, together with the Forward Plan of Key Decisions for the period 1st March 2011 to 30th June 2011 were also attached to the report.

RESOLVED-

- a) That the contents of the report and appendices be noted.
- b) That the Executive Board minutes of 11th February 2011, together with the Forward Plan of Key Decisions for the period 1st March 2011 to 30th June 2011 be noted.
- c) That the Board's Principal Scrutiny Adviser be requested to update the work programme in accordance with the decisions taken at today's meeting.

132 Date and Time of Next Meeting

Tuesday 5th April 2011 at 10.00am (Pre meeting for Board Members at 9.30am)

(The meeting concluded at 2.10pm)